

Article title: Establishment and Application of an Index System for the Risk of Drug Shortages in China: Based on Delphi Method and Analytic Hierarchy Process.

Journal name: International Journal of Health Policy and Management (IJHPM)

Authors' information: Yin Shi^{1,2,3,4}, Shusen Sun^{1,2,3,4,5}, Jing Deng⁶, Shao Liu^{1,2,3,4}, Tao Yin^{1,2,3,4}, Qilin Peng^{1,2,3,4}, Zhicheng Gong^{1,2,3,4}, Zihua Cheng^{2,3,7}, Boting Zhou^{1,2,3,4*}

¹ Department of Pharmacy, Xiangya Hospital, Central South University, Changsha, China.

² National Clinical Research Center for Geriatric Disorders, Xiangya Hospital, Central South University, Changsha, China.

³ Hunan Drug Shortage Surveillance and Early Warning Center, Changsha, China.

⁴ The Hunan Institute of Pharmacy Practice and Clinical Research, Changsha, China.

⁵ Department of Pharmacy Practice, College of Pharmacy and Health Sciences, Western New England University, Springfield, MA, USA.

⁶ Department of Epidemiology and Health Statistics, XiangYa School of Public Health, Central South University, Changsha, China.

⁷ Department of General Surgery, Xiangya Hospital, Central South University, Changsha, China.

(Corresponding author: botingzhou0918@126.com)

Supplementary file 2. Contains Table S6-Table S7

Table S6: Judgment matrix and consistency test of the indexes

Table S7: The characteristics of drugs at different risk levels

Table S6 Judgment matrix and consistency test of the indexes

Judgment matrix of first-level indexes (A1 Pharmaceutical properties, A2 Supply stability, A3 Drug accessibility, A4 Causes of shortage)															
Consistency test	Expert 1	Expert 2	Expert 3	Expert 4	Expert 5	Expert 6	Expert 7	Expert 8	Expert 9	Expert 10	Expert 11	Expert 12	Expert 13	Expert 14	Expert 15
<i>CR</i>	0.0909	0.0806	0.0039	0.0618	0.0790	0.0676	0.0227	0.0891	0.0771	0.0806	0.0866	0.0989	0.0675	0.0413	0.0039
λ_{max}	4.2428	4.2153	4.0104	4.1649	4.2109	4.1806	4.0606	4.2379	4.2059	4.2153	4.2314	4.2640	4.1801	4.1102	4.0104

Judgment matrix of second-level indexes (B1 Essential drug classification, B2 Special classification, B3 Availability or alternatives, B4 Clinically necessary)															
Consistency test	Expert 1	Expert 2	Expert 3	Expert 4	Expert 5	Expert 6	Expert 7	Expert 8	Expert 9	Expert 10	Expert 11	Expert 12	Expert 13	Expert 14	Expert 15
<i>CR</i>	0.0287	0.0769	0.0813	0.0023	0.0790	0.0227	0.0880	0.0822	0.0940	0.0789	0.0328	0.0000	0.0909	0.0429	0.0766
λ_{max}	4.0766	4.2053	4.2171	4.0062	4.2109	4.0606	4.2350	4.2194	4.2510	4.2106	4.0876	4.0000	4.2428	4.1145	4.2046

Judgment matrix of second-level indexes (B5 Duration of short supply, B6 Scope of short supply, B7 Number of manufacturers in province)															
Consistency test	Expert 1	Expert 2	Expert 3	Expert 4	Expert 5	Expert 6	Expert 7	Expert 8	Expert 9	Expert 10	Expert 11	Expert 12	Expert 13	Expert 14	Expert 15
<i>CR</i>	0.0053	0.0825	0.0000	0.0088	0.0961	0.0000	0.0000	0.0904	0.0904	0.0624	0.0370	0.0279	0.0176	0.0961	0.0000
λ_{max}	3.0055	3.0858	3.0000	3.0092	3.0999	3.0000	3.0000	3.0940	3.0940	3.0649	3.0385	3.0291	3.0183	3.0999	3.0000

Judgment matrix of second-level indexes (B8 Number of medical institutions or distribution enterprises experiencing drug shortages, B9 Categories of medical institutions experiencing drug shortages)															
Consistency test	Expert 1	Expert 2	Expert 3	Expert 4	Expert 5	Expert 6	Expert 7	Expert 8	Expert 9	Expert 10	Expert 11	Expert 12	Expert 13	Expert 14	Expert 15
<i>CR</i>	0.0000	0.0825	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000
λ_{max}	2.0000	3.0858	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000

Judgment matrix of second-level indexes (B10 Supply related causes, B11 Demand related causes)															
---	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

Consistency test	Expert 1	Expert 2	Expert 3	Expert 4	Expert 5	Expert 6	Expert 7	Expert 8	Expert 9	Expert 10	Expert 11	Expert 12	Expert 13	Expert 14	Expert 15
<i>CR</i>	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000
λ_{\max}	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000

Judgment matrix of third-level indexes (C1 Essential drugs, C2 Nonessential drugs)

Consistency test	Expert 1	Expert 2	Expert 3	Expert 4	Expert 5	Expert 6	Expert 7	Expert 8	Expert 9	Expert 10	Expert 11	Expert 12	Expert 13	Expert 14	Expert 15
<i>CR</i>	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000
λ_{\max}	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000

Judgment matrix of third-level indexes (C3 Emergency drugs, C4 Detoxification drugs, C5 Drugs for rare diseases, C6 Other drugs)

Consistency test	Expert 1	Expert 2	Expert 3	Expert 4	Expert 5	Expert 6	Expert 7	Expert 8	Expert 9	Expert 10	Expert 11	Expert 12	Expert 13	Expert 14	Expert 15
<i>CR</i>	0.0204	0.0963	0.0123	0.0312	0.0826	0.0227	0.0123	0.0940	0.0163	0.0212	0.0888	0.0397	0.0822	0.0339	0.0123
λ_{\max}	4.0544	4.2572	4.0328	4.0833	4.2206	4.0606	4.0328	4.2509	4.0435	4.0566	4.2371	4.1061	4.2194	4.0905	4.0328

Judgment matrix of third-level indexes (C7 Alternative exists, C8 Full alternative does not exist, C9 No alternative)

Consistency test	Expert 1	Expert 2	Expert 3	Expert 4	Expert 5	Expert 6	Expert 7	Expert 8	Expert 9	Expert 10	Expert 11	Expert 12	Expert 13	Expert 14	Expert 15
<i>CR</i>	0.0772	0.0516	0.0904	0.0685	0.0707	0.0685	0.0904	0.0707	0.0772	0.0311	0.0904	0.0772	0.0707	0.0685	0.0685
λ_{\max}	3.0803	3.0536	3.0940	3.0713	3.0735	3.0713	3.0940	3.0735	3.0803	3.0324	3.0940	3.0803	3.0735	3.0713	3.0713

Judgment matrix of third-level indexes (C10 Diagnose and treat diseases that are life-threatening or seriously impair quality of life, C11 Life-sustaining, cure disease or delay progression of the disease significantly, including the diagnosis of these diseases, C12 Discontinuity of treatment has a significant impact on clinical diagnosis, treatment and health outcomes of patient)

Consistency test	Expert 1	Expert 2	Expert 3	Expert 4	Expert 5	Expert 6	Expert 7	Expert 8	Expert 9	Expert 10	Expert 11	Expert 12	Expert 13	Expert 14	Expert 15
<i>CR</i>	0.0336	0.0904	0.0036	0.0707	0.0355	0.0176	0.0036	0.0624	0.0000	0.0516	0.0904	0.0176	0.0370	0.0516	0.0036

λ_{\max}	3.0349	3.0940	3.0037	3.0735	3.0369	3.0183	3.0037	3.0649	3.0000	3.0536	3.0940	3.0183	3.0385	3.0536	3.0037
------------------	--------	--------	--------	--------	--------	--------	--------	--------	--------	--------	--------	--------	--------	--------	--------

Judgment matrix of third-level indexes (C13 Time of short supply ≥ 6 months, C14 Time of short supply ≥ 3 months, C15 Time of short supply ≥ 1 months)

Consistency test	Expert 1	Expert 2	Expert 3	Expert 4	Expert 5	Expert 6	Expert 7	Expert 8	Expert 9	Expert 10	Expert 11	Expert 12	Expert 13	Expert 14	Expert 15
CR	0.0516	0.0336	0.0176	0.0036	0.0772	0.0685	0.0370	0.0516	0.0772	0.0707	0.0088	0.0068	0.0624	0.0772	0.0176
λ_{\max}	3.0536	3.0349	3.0183	3.0037	3.0803	3.0713	3.0385	3.0536	3.0803	3.0735	3.0092	3.0070	3.0649	3.0803	3.0183

Judgment matrix of third-level indexes (C16 Cities with short supply ≤ 5 , C17 Cities with short supply > 5)

Consistency test	Expert 1	Expert 2	Expert 3	Expert 4	Expert 5	Expert 6	Expert 7	Expert 8	Expert 9	Expert 10	Expert 11	Expert 12	Expert 13	Expert 14	Expert 15
CR	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000
λ_{\max}	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000

Judgment matrix of third-level indexes (C18 Manufactured solely, C19 Number of manufacturers ≥ 2)

Consistency test	Expert 1	Expert 2	Expert 3	Expert 4	Expert 5	Expert 6	Expert 7	Expert 8	Expert 9	Expert 10	Expert 11	Expert 12	Expert 13	Expert 14	Expert 15
CR	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000
λ_{\max}	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000	2.0000

Judgment matrix of third-level indexes (C20 Number of medical institutions or distribution enterprises experiencing short supply ≤ 5 , C21 Number of medical institutions or distribution enterprises experiencing short supply between 6 and 10, C22 Number of medical institutions or distribution enterprises experiencing short supply > 10)

Consistency test	Expert 1	Expert 2	Expert 3	Expert 4	Expert 5	Expert 6	Expert 7	Expert 8	Expert 9	Expert 10	Expert 11	Expert 12	Expert 13	Expert 14	Expert 15
CR	0.0624	0.0772	0.0068	0.0825	0.0772	0.0707	0.0068	0.0904	0.0176	0.0000	0.0068	0.0624	0.0624	0.0685	0.0068
λ_{\max}	3.0649	3.0803	3.0070	3.0858	3.0803	3.0735	3.0070	3.0940	3.0183	3.0000	3.0070	3.0649	3.0649	3.0713	3.0070

Judgment matrix of third-level indexes (C23 All are primary health care institutions, C24 All are secondary health care institutions, C25 All are tertiary health care institutions, C26 Primary

and secondary/tertiary health care institutions, C27 Secondary and tertiary health care institutions, C28 Primary, secondary, and tertiary health care institutions)															
Consistency test	Expert 1	Expert 2	Expert 3	Expert 4	Expert 5	Expert 6	Expert 7	Expert 8	Expert 9	Expert 10	Expert 11	Expert 12	Expert 13	Expert 14	Expert 15
CR	0.0878	0.0969	0.0211	0.0645	0.0946	0.0979	0.0348	0.0963	0.0935	0.0723	0.0798	0.0623	0.0908	0.0513	0.0211
λ_{\max}	6.5529	6.6108	6.1332	6.4062	6.5960	6.6166	6.2193	6.6065	6.5892	6.4557	6.5030	6.3926	6.5721	6.3232	6.1332

Judgment matrix of third-level indexes (C29 Geographical remoteness, C30 Renovation of production line, C31 Shortage of raw materials, C32 Monopoly of raw materials)															
Consistency test	Expert 1	Expert 2	Expert 3	Expert 4	Expert 5	Expert 6	Expert 7	Expert 8	Expert 9	Expert 10	Expert 11	Expert 12	Expert 13	Expert 14	Expert 15
CR	0.0992	0.0981	0.0123	0.0665	0.0790	0.0854	0.0123	0.0945	0.0895	0.0976	0.0900	0.0444	0.0822	0.0981	0.0123
λ_{\max}	4.2650	4.2620	4.0328	4.1776	4.2109	4.2280	4.0328	4.2524	4.2389	4.2606	4.2404	4.1184	4.2195	4.2620	4.0328

Judgment matrix of third-level indexes (C33 Trading with low price, C34 Low clinical demand, C35 Failure of bid or bid rejection, C36 Limit order)															
Consistency test	Expert 1	Expert 2	Expert 3	Expert 4	Expert 5	Expert 6	Expert 7	Expert 8	Expert 9	Expert 10	Expert 11	Expert 12	Expert 13	Expert 14	Expert 15
CR	0.0454	0.0933	0.0000	0.0172	0.0922	0.0454	0.0000	0.0845	0.0000	0.0806	0.0806	0.0000	0.0295	0.0806	0.0000
λ_{\max}	4.1213	4.2492	4.0000	4.0458	4.2463	4.1213	4.0000	4.2257	4.0000	4.2153	4.2153	4.0000	4.0788	4.2153	4.0000

CR, consistency ratio

Table S7 The characteristics of drugs at different risk levels

	Total(n=383)	High risk^a (n=6)	Medium risk^b (n=39)	Low risk^c (n=338)
Essential drug classification				
Essential drugs	208 (54.31%)	4 (66.67%)	30 (76.92%)	174 (51.48%)
Nonessential drugs	175 4(5.69%)	2 (33.33%)	9 (23.08%)	164 (48.52%)
Special classification				
Emergency drugs	38 (9.92%)	3 (50.00%)	5 (12.82%)	30 (8.88%)
Detoxification drugs	0	0	0	0
Drugs for rare diseases	0	0	0	0
Other drugs	345 (90.08%)	3 (50.00%)	34 (87.18%)	308 (91.12%)
Availability or alternatives				
Alternative exists	371 (96.87%)	4 (66.67%)	35 (89.74%)	332 (98.22%)
Full alternative does not exist	10 (2.61%)	0 (33.33%)	4 (10.26%)	6 (1.78%)
No alternative	2 (0.52%)	2	0	0
Duration of short supply				
Time of short supply ≥ 6 months	123 (32.11%)	6 (100.00%)	29 (74.36%)	88 (26.04%)
Time of short supply ≥ 3 months	91 (23.76%)	0	5 (12.82%)	86 (25.44%)
Time of short supply ≥ 1 months	169 (44.13%)	0	5 (12.82%)	164 (48.52%)
Scope of short supply				
Cities with short supply ≤ 5	350 (91.38%)	0	17 (43.59%)	333 (98.52%)
Cities with short supply > 5	33 (8.62%)	6 (100%)	22 (56.41%)	5 (1.48%)
Number of manufacturers in province				
Manufactured solely	61 (15.93%)	1 (16.67%)	4 (10.26%)	56 (16.57%)
Number of manufacturers ≥ 2	322 (84.07%)	5 (83.33%)	35 (89.74%)	282 (83.43%)
Number of medical institutions or distribution enterprises experiencing drug shortages				
Medical institutions or distribution enterprises experiencing short supply ≤ 5	340 (88.77%)	0	9 (23.08%)	331 (97.93%)
Medical institutions or distribution enterprises experiencing short supply between 6-10	29 (7.57%)	0	22 (56.41%)	7 (2.07%)
Medical institutions or distribution enterprises experiencing short supply > 10	14 (3.66%)	6 (100%)	8 (20.51%)	0

Categories of medical institutions experiencing drug shortages

All are primary health care institutions	120 (34.19%)	0	0	120 (38.71%)
All are secondary health care institutions	67 (19.09%)	0	2 (5.71%)	65 (20.97%)
All are tertiary health care institutions	69 (19.66%)	0	3 (8.57%)	66 (21.29%)
Primary and secondary health care institutions	38 (10.83%)	0	7 (20%)	31 (10.00%)
Secondary and tertiary health care institutions	38 (10.83%)	3 (50%)	12 (34.29%)	23 (7.42%)
Primary, secondary, and tertiary health care institutions	19 (5.41%)	3 (50%)	11 (31.43%)	5 (1.61%)

^a High risk represented the drug with a shortage risk score between 70-100 points.

^b Medium risk represented the drug with a shortage risk score between 40-69 points.

^c Low risk represented the drug with a shortage risk score between 0-39 points.